

ENBRIDGE GAS DISTRIBUTION INC. AND UNION GAS LIMITED

Undertaking of Mr. Culbert
To Mr. Garner

REF: Tr.2, p.34

To prepare a revised version of the table at VECC Compendium Tab 3, page 17, to show non-weather-normalized results for both utilities

The Applicants note the reference should be to VECC Compendium Tab 3, p. 13. Please see the revised table below. In comparison to the table which was originally provided in Exhibit JT1.3, the EGD results have been updated to include actual achieved utility ROEs (non-weather normalized) in addition to the weather normalized ROEs.

EGD Earning Sharing Results

Year	Ratepayer Share of ESM (\$Millions)	Gross Normalized Over Earnings		Normalized Achieved ROE % (1)	Allowed ROE %	Threshold / Deadband %	Ratepayer / Shareholder Sharing Ratio %	ESM / Deferral Clearance Proceeding
		(Above Allowed ROE + Threshold) (\$Millions)	Achieved ROE %					
2008	5.60	11.20	11.87%	10.21%	8.66%	1.00%	50%/50%	EB-2009-0055
2009	19.30	38.60	12.36%	11.20%	8.31%	1.00%	50%/50%	EB-2010-0042
2010	17.35	34.70	10.25%	11.10%	8.37%	1.00%	50%/50%	EB-2011-0008
2011	14.30	28.60	10.43%	10.38%	7.94%	1.00%	50%/50%	EB-2012-0055
2012	7.39	14.80	7.62%	9.28%	7.52%	1.00%	50%/50%	EB-2013-0046
2013	-	31.20	11.13%	10.41%	8.93%	N/A	N/A	No ESM
2014	12.65	25.30	12.39%	10.46%	9.36%	0.00%	50%/50%	EB-2015-0122
2015	6.45	12.90	10.41%	9.82%	9.30%	0.00%	50%/50%	EB-2016-0142
2016	3.40	6.80	8.76%	9.42%	9.19%	0.00%	50%/50%	EB-2017-0102
2017	23.55	47.10	9.71%	10.27%	8.78%	0.00%	50%/50%	Preliminary results

Union Earning Sharing Results

Year	Ratepayer Share of ESM (\$Millions)	Gross Over Earnings		Achieved ROE % (1)	Allowed ROE %	Threshold / Deadband %	Ratepayer / Shareholder Sharing Ratio %	ESM / Deferral Clearance Proceeding
		(Above Allowed ROE + Threshold) (\$Millions)	Achieved ROE %					
2008	34.17	46.03	13.35%		8.81%	2.00%	90%/10%	EB-2009-0101
2009	7.40	14.79	11.24%		8.47%	2.00%	50%/50%	EB-2010-0039
2010	3.43	6.87	10.91%		8.54%	2.00%	50%/50%	EB-2011-0038
2011	2.54	5.08	10.38%		8.10%	2.00%	50%/50%	EB-2012-0087
2012	15.13	24.97	11.03%		7.67%	2.00%	90%/10%	EB-2013-0109
2013	-	32.20	10.67%		8.93%	N/A	N/A	No ESM
2014	7.42	14.85	10.69%		8.93%	1.00%	50%/50%	EB-2015-0010
2015	-	-	9.89%		8.93%	1.00%	N/A	EB-2016-0118
2016	-	-	9.24%		8.93%	1.00%	N/A	EB-2017-0091
2017	-	-	9.15%		8.93%	1.00%	N/A	Preliminary results

Notes:

(1) Union reports achieved ROE on an actual basis while EGD reports achieved ROE on a weather-normalized basis.